



WRIGHT MEMORIAL PUBLIC LIBRARY

1776 Far Hills Avenue • Dayton (Oakwood), Ohio 45419-2531
(937) 294-7171 Fax (937) 294-8578

Request for Reconsideration of Library Material

We are sorry if you have been offended by any material in the library's collection. Wright Memorial Public Library subscribes to the Library Bill of Rights as adopted by the American Library Association. This document reads, in part: "Books and other library resources should be provided for the interest, information, and enlightenment of all people of the community the library serves. Materials should not be excluded because of the origin, background, or views of those contributing to their creation." Everyone's tastes are different and it is the library's responsibility to provide materials on a multitude of subjects and viewpoints, in many styles.

If you think that an item does not belong in the library, we invite you to fill out this form and return it to the front desk. The staff will see that it is given to the library director, who will be in touch with you regarding your request.

Your name: _____

Date: 8-16-16

Address: _____

City: _____ State: _____ Zip: _____

Phone: _____

Representing:

Self

Organization: _____

Material on which you wish to comment:

Title: Garrison Keillor Liberty

Author, artist, or producer: Garrison Keillor

What brought this work to your attention?

What are your concerns about this work and/or what are your specific objections to it?
(Use back or additional pages if you wish.)

Contains very X rated material

What would you like the library to do with this work?

Re-evaluate it.

Withdraw it from the collection.

Other: _____

Is there a work representing your viewpoint that you would like to recommend for the library?

Signature: _____



Wright Memorial

Public Library

Administration

Kristi Hale
Director

Steve Maag
Fiscal Officer

Linda Cosgrove
Administrative
Services Coordinator

Board of Trustees

Lu Ann Stanley
President

Joshua Lounsbury
Vice President

Melissa Wolcott
Secretary

Linda Deitz

Delia McMullen

Joseph Fulford

Kathleen Webb

August 17, 2016

Dear

Thank you for your recent visit to Wright Memorial Public Library. We received your *Request for Reconsideration of Library Material* regarding Garrison Keillor's audiobook, *Liberty*.

It is the goal of the Wright Memorial Public Library Board of Trustees to recognize the diverse library needs of all citizens, regardless of age, race, national origin, religious, social, or political views. The Library recognizes that some materials are controversial and that any given item may offend some users. Selection decisions are not made on the basis of any anticipated approval or disapproval, but on the merits of the work in relation to the overall development of the collection and the necessity of meeting the needs of many individuals with a broad range of interests and viewpoints. I have enclosed a copy of our Collection Development policy for your reference.

After receiving your request, we again reviewed the title indicated against the selection criteria from our policy manual. Here is a summary of our findings:

- This title is owned in audio format by many local public libraries, numerous Ohio public libraries, and hundreds of public libraries across the nation.
- The title is well reviewed by professional organizations such as the NY Times, the Washington Post, USA Today, Booklist, and Publisher's Weekly.
- The copy at Wright Library has been available since 2009 and has circulated 42 times without previous complaints.

Given these criteria, we have decided to retain the book in Wright Library's collection. It is not the practice of Wright Library to apply parental advisories on materials, because there is no objective criteria or standards to use. Many films and music CDs carry their own ratings or advisories on the packaging, and Wright Library takes care not to cover those advisories when preparing the materials for circulation. Unfortunately, there are no such advisories on audio books.

I can understand, given Keillor's general reputation, why someone might be surprised to hear mature content. There are some websites with customer reviews, such as Amazon.com and Goodreads.com, which might be helpful to you in evaluating the propriety of a book for your family. You may also ask one of our Librarians to research a title for you. While



Wright Memorial

Public Library

Administration

Kristi Hale
Director

Steve Maag
Fiscal Officer

Linda Cosgrove
*Administrative
Services Coordinator*

Board of Trustees

Lu Ann Stanley
President

Joshua Lounsbury
Vice President

Melissa Wolcott
Secretary

Linda Deitz

Delia McMullen

Joseph Fulford

Kathleen Webb

they would not be able to guarantee that the content meets your standards, they could help you find reader comments that might be informative.

If you would like to appeal this decision, you may address the Board of Trustees at one of its regular meetings. In addition, we welcome your audiobook recommendations for the Library's collection. We truly want to provide you with materials that are appropriate for yourself and your family.

Please feel free to contact me should you have additional questions or concerns.

Thank you,

Kristi J. Hale
Director

From: [Kristi Hale](#)
To: [Elizabeth Schmidt](#)
Cc: [Brian Potts](#)
Subject: RE: heads-up
Date: Thursday, August 18, 2016 10:26:00 AM
Attachments: [request for reconsideration liberty.docx](#)

Hi Elizabeth,

Brian reviewed the material, and we decided to retain it without labels. If we decided to add a label, we would need to use some kind of objective criteria, and then apply that criteria to the whole audiobook collection. I don't know what that criteria would be based on, and it would get very subjective from there. I'm sure there are more "ribald" audiobooks than "Liberty" – it's just that it was surprising, coming from Garrison Keillor.

I empathize with her. I hope the attached letter, which is being mailed today, conveys that message. Let me know if you have any questions.

Kristi

From: Elizabeth Schmidt
Sent: Tuesday, August 16, 2016 3:52 PM
To: Kristi Hale <hale@wrightlibrary.org>; Brian Potts <potts@wrightlibrary.org>
Subject: heads-up

I'm in an awkward spot.

_____ is a long-time patron and library supporter. She recently checked out a Garrison Keillor Book on CD (Liberty) from our library for a trip down to NC to visit her granddaughter. _____ are big Keillor fans and weren't prepared for the "X-rated" (_____ words) content.

She came in today and filled out a "reconsider materials" request. I encouraged her to say something because she's entitled to have her concerns addressed, and Terry offered her the form. She is most upset that there was no indication on the label of this content (I haven't heard/read it. It's described as "ribald" on amazon.) and she could easily have had a grandchild in the car. I don't believe she thinks the library shouldn't own it, only that she should have been warned about content. A sticker saying "explicit content" would probably be satisfactory, but I don't know if we do that.

I've recently taken on audiobooks, but I don't want to be involved with this decision. I know you'll do what's right for the library and communicate with _____ in a respectful way.
Thanks! Elizabeth

Here are a few reviews from amazon that show her perspective:

I've enjoyed most of Keillor's work, and I'm certainly no prude. The story line and concept were solid, and the characters, as usual for Keillor, well-developed. My break with the book was as my first exposure to what must be, given his work since, Keillor's own growing interest in the prurient and salacious. It is possible to completely encompass and describe a man having an affair with a woman without going into exhaustive detail about her "folds" and "dampness" and "bush" and the shape of her aureola.

I got the audiobook of Liberty to listen to with my husband on a recent car trip. We enjoyed the book until Garrison began describing a sexual affair in too much detail. It wasn't necessary to get the point across. My husband finally asked me to turn it off and I totally agreed with him. Our young children enjoy listening to A Prairie Home Companion some times. Thank goodness they didn't listen to this!



Elizabeth Schmidt *Reference Librarian*

Wright Memorial Public Library

1776 Far Hills Avenue

Oakwood, OH 45419-2531

T 937 294-7171 | F 937 294-8578

schmidt@wrightlibrary.org wrightlibrary.org



Wright Memorial

Public Library

Administration

Kristi Hale
Director

Steve Maag
Fiscal Officer

Linda Cosgrove
*Administrative
Services Coordinator*

Board of Trustees

Lu Ann Stanley
President

Joshua Lounsbury
Vice President

Melissa Wolcott
Secretary

Linda Deitz

Delia McMullen

Joseph Fulford

Kathleen Webb

August 17, 2016

Dear _____,

Thank you for your recent visit to Wright Memorial Public Library. We received your *Request for Reconsideration of Library Material* regarding Garrison Keillor's audiobook, *Liberty*.

It is the goal of the Wright Memorial Public Library Board of Trustees to recognize the diverse library needs of all citizens, regardless of age, race, national origin, religious, social, or political views. The Library recognizes that some materials are controversial and that any given item may offend some users. Selection decisions are not made on the basis of any anticipated approval or disapproval, but on the merits of the work in relation to the overall development of the collection and the necessity of meeting the needs of many individuals with a broad range of interests and viewpoints. I have enclosed a copy of our Collection Development policy for your reference.

After receiving your request, we again reviewed the title indicated against the selection criteria from our policy manual. Here is a summary of our findings:

- This title is owned in audio format by many local public libraries, numerous Ohio public libraries, and hundreds of public libraries across the nation.
- The title is well reviewed by professional organizations such as the NY Times, the Washington Post, USA Today, Booklist, and Publisher's Weekly.
- The copy at Wright Library has been available since 2009 and has circulated 42 times without previous complaints.

Given these criteria, we have decided to retain the book in Wright Library's collection. It is not the practice of Wright Library to apply parental advisories on materials, because there is no objective criteria or standards to use. Many films and music CDs carry their own ratings or advisories on the packaging, and Wright Library takes care not to cover those advisories when preparing the materials for circulation. Unfortunately, there are no such advisories on audio books.

I can understand, given Keillor's general reputation, why someone might be surprised to hear mature content. There are some websites with customer reviews, such as Amazon.com and Goodreads.com, which might be helpful to you in evaluating the propriety of a book for your family. You may also ask one of our Librarians to research a title for you. While



Wright Memorial

Public Library

Administration

Kristi Hale
Director

Steve Maag
Fiscal Officer

Linda Cosgrove
*Administrative
Services Coordinator*

Board of Trustees

Lu Ann Stanley
President

Joshua Lounsbury
Vice President

Melissa Wolcott
Secretary

Linda Deitz

Delia McMullen

Joseph Fulford

Kathleen Webb

they would not be able to guarantee that the content meets your standards, they could help you find reader comments that might be informative.

If you would like to appeal this decision, you may address the Board of Trustees at one of its regular meetings. In addition, we welcome your audiobook recommendations for the Library's collection. We truly want to provide you with materials that are appropriate for yourself and your family.

Please feel free to contact me should you have additional questions or concerns.

Thank you,

Kristi J. Hale
Director

From: [Brian Potts](#)
To: [Kristi Hale](#)
Cc: [Elizabeth Schmidt](#)
Subject: Request for Reconsideration of Material
Date: Wednesday, August 17, 2016 11:59:51 AM
Attachments: [image003.png](#)

I have skimmed through the book on CD *Liberty* by Garrison Keillor and there are definitely passages of mature content that may be objectionable to some; however, as a novel written for adults, it is not inappropriate. The Library has owned the book on CD since 2009 and in 42 checkouts, this is the first complaint. It is understandable that the mature content would be unexpected (I didn't expect it) in a Garrison Keillor Lake Wobegon novel, especially if you are only familiar with the radio show. Listening to it with a grandchild would be very uncomfortable. My preference is to stand by the intellectual freedom clause in the Collection Development policy, while acknowledging the validity of the patron's position. In this case, I feel her complaint is truly with the author's choices and not with the library's. I would rather not add a "This audiobook contains mature content." label (that's a slippery slope), but recognize that it may satisfy the patron. It may be worth mentioning that when asked, the staff always attempt to provide a description of a work, even one we are not familiar with, but without guaranteeing there isn't something in it that might be objectionable to someone.

Brian



Brian Potts *Adult Services Coordinator*
Wright Memorial Public Library

1776 Far Hills Avenue,
Oakwood, OH 45419-2531
T 937 294-7171 | F 937 294-8578
potts@wrightlibrary.org | wrightlibrary.org

[Visit the Wright Library Digital Collection](#)

From:
To: [Kristi Hale](#)
Subject: audio book review
Date: Monday, August 22, 2016 8:20:44 AM
Attachments: [Keillor.doc](#)

Kristi,
Please see attached.

Kristi Hale, Director

Wright Memorial Public Library

Dear Kristi,

I would like to thank you for taking the time to respond to my report on the Garrison Keillor audio book Liberty.

I have no objection to this being maintained in the library. My point was that it should be marked as appropriate for adults only. I appreciate knowing that I can go to Goodreads.com for reviews. I notice a few of the reviewers were unhappy with the twists and turns the story took. It is unfortunate that audio books do not carry any mention of adult content.

From: [Brian Potts](#)
To: [Kristi Hale](#)
Subject: RE: Request for reconsideration - Liberty
Date: Thursday, August 18, 2016 9:58:54 AM
Attachments: [image002.png](#)

I think it's excellent.

From: Kristi Hale
Sent: Thursday, August 18, 2016 9:27 AM
To: Brian Potts <potts@wrightlibrary.org>
Subject: Request for reconsideration - Liberty

Here's the letter:

[X:\Administration\Correspondence\request for reconsideration liberty.docx](#)

I haven't sent it yet, so let me know if you think it needs something.
Kristi



Kristi Hale *Director*
Wright Memorial Public Library

1776 Far Hills Avenue
Oakwood, OH 45419-2531
T 937 294-8572 | F 937 294-8578
hale@wrightlibrary.org | wrightlibrary.org